

Swarthmore College

Works

Religion Faculty Works

Religion

10-1-1988

Review Of "Christ In Christian Tradition. Volume 2: From The Council Of Calcedon (451) To Gregory The Great (590-604). Part One: Reception And Contradiction" By A. Grillmeier, Translated By P. Allen And J. Cawte

P. Linwood Urban
Swarthmore College

Follow this and additional works at: <https://works.swarthmore.edu/fac-religion>



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

P. Linwood Urban. (1988). "Review Of "Christ In Christian Tradition. Volume 2: From The Council Of Calcedon (451) To Gregory The Great (590-604). Part One: Reception And Contradiction" By A. Grillmeier, Translated By P. Allen And J. Cawte". *Anglican Theological Review*. Volume 70, Issue 4. 367-369.
<https://works.swarthmore.edu/fac-religion/343>

An [accessible version](#) of this publication has been made available courtesy of Swarthmore College Libraries. For further accessibility assistance, please contact openaccess@swarthmore.edu with the title or URL of any relevant works.

This work is brought to you for free by Swarthmore College Libraries' Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in Religion Faculty Works by an authorized administrator of Works. For more information, please contact myworks@swarthmore.edu.

In spite of such criticisms, this is an important work. Time after time, questions I raised about balanced interpretation were answered within a page. *Athens and Jerusalem* is the only volume I know that can be mentioned favorably in the same breath with Cochrane's *Christianity and Culture*.

FREDERICK W. NORRIS

Emmanuel School of Religion
Johnson City, Tennessee

Christ in Christian Tradition. Vol. 2; From the Council of Chalcedon (451) to Gregory the Great (590–604). Part One: Reception and Contradiction. By Aloys Grillmeier. Translated by Pauline Allen and John Cawte. Atlanta: Knox, 1987, xxi + 340 pp. \$34.95 (cloth).

Aloys Grillmeier, Professor Emeritus of Dogmatics and History of Dogmatics at the Philosophisch-Theologische Hochschule St. Georgen, Frankfurt am Main, has embarked upon a monumental three-volume study of the antecedents and consequences of the Council of Chalcedon from apostolic times to the year 800. Volume One traces the christological problem from the apostolic age through Chalcedon. Far from settling the issues, Chalcedon itself became a subject of controversy, so much so that the christological question might be said to dominate theology until about 800, when John of Damascus stabilized thinking in the East, and the West united in a single-minded but uncomplicated trust in Chalcedon. Volume Two, Part One, now available in this able and readable translation, carries the discussion of the aftermath of the council to the beginning of the reign of Justinian I (ca. 530).

While Volume One was devoted to the development of christology and to the solutions to the various questions generated by the attempts of the early fathers to present in intelligible form the conviction that God was in Christ reconciling the world to himself, Volume Two, Part One focuses on the attempts of bishops and emperors to deal with Chalcedon. Some of course wanted it upheld, some wanted it modified, and some wanted it abrogated. Emperors adopted now one of these courses of action, and now another. All in all, it was an exceedingly tumultuous era for the church.

Volume One has accustomed the reader to Grillmeier's thoroughness

and care in the treatment of the sources. An additional feature of Volume Two, Part One is an extensive catalogue of primary materials to be used in the examination of Chalcedon's aftermath. These materials are presented according to type: the synodical acts of the separated as well as the catholic churches; works of church history and hagiography from all sources, both orthodox and heterodox; anthologies of writings on christology by theologians and the leaders of various factions; catalogues of heresies and brief descriptions of them; summaries of definitions of christological terms and collections of short discussions of christological concepts. This extensive catalogue facilitates Grillmeier's ecumenical intentions. One of his central theses is that supporters and opponents of Chalcedon held the same basic christology. They all believed that in Jesus both God and man were united. Opponents could not accept the doctrine of "the two natures in one person." Because of the extensive list of sources, students will find ready access to material to test this thesis of Grillmeier's, and to do so in the way he believes most helpful to ecumenism, by examining the synodical acts of the separated churches *in situ*. In summary, Grillmeier attributes the schisms to the lack of theological imagination on the part of the many antagonists. They all failed to see beyond the various divisive linguistic formulations to their common foundation of faith in the incarnation.

With these concerns, one might expect Grillmeier to have continued the detailed christological discussion he so ably carried out in Volume One. In the present work, however, he concentrates on the ecclesiastical and political aspects of the controversy over Chalcedon. The primary ecclesiastical lesson he draws from this history is that attempts at compromise that are not built upon genuine theological agreement are doomed to failure and increase divisiveness rather than ameliorate it. The failure of the Emperor Zeno's *Henoticon* to provide a basis for unity is a case in point. The strategy of the *Henoticon's* compromise was to pick bits and pieces from the positions of the various adversaries, neither fully agreeing nor fully disagreeing with any position. This attempt to provide something for everyone, while withholding full agreement from anyone, left everyone dissatisfied. In the end the *Henoticon* achieved nothing. Grillmeier's conclusion that superficial compromise cannot maintain ecclesiastical unity is a salutary caution for any age.

There is also rich material here for evaluating the politics of the imperial church. Throughout this period no one questioned the right of the emperor to protect and advance the cause of Christian orthodoxy. Indeed, all saw it as an imperial duty to do so. Hence all sides appealed to the emperor to establish and enforce the supremacy of their particular doctrine. Grillmeier voices concern over this state of affairs. But the problem as he sees it is the questionable legitimacy of the state's

intervention in matters of faith and morals. He does not raise as a problem the legitimacy of the church's connivance with the civil power to enforce orthodoxy. The complicity of the church in the forcible suppression of heresies, the denial of freedom of speech, the persecution of dissenting parties—which included the taking of many lives—is a ghastly stain upon the Christian record. Surely this aspect of the controversy generated by Chalcedon deserves more than the mention it barely receives in Grillmeier's study.

We are all in Grillmeier's debt for this present installment of his three-volume study of Chalcedon and its aftermath. His erudite and detailed discussion of the issues as they bear on Christian unity both within and between churches is especially timely.

LINWOOD URBAN

Swarthmore College
Swarthmore, Pennsylvania

Certain Sermons or Homilies (1547) and A Homily against Disobedience and Wilful Rebellion (1570): A Critical Edition. Edited by Ronald B. Bond. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press, 1987, xii + 269 pp. \$40 (cloth).

The appearance of Bond's edition of the Book of Homilies makes available once more, outside research libraries, a major text of the English Reformation. We remember readily that the first editions of the Book of Common Prayer were prepared by Archbishop Cranmer during the reign of Edward VI. We forget that the Prayer Book was part of a larger program of reform that changed the medieval Latin church into a reformed vernacular church. Bond's edition reminds us that the Book of Homilies, published in the summer of 1547, was the second of a series of books which every parish church in England was required to own and use. The first had been the Great Bible (1539); to follow were a translation of Erasmus' Paraphrases on the Gospels and Acts (1548), the Book of Common Prayer (1549 and 1552), the Primer (1553), and the Articles of Religion (1553).

The Book of Homilies of 1547 contains twelve sermons that clergy were instructed to read "at hygh masse" every Sunday in the order in which they appeared in the Book. It was thus intended to be a companion to the Book of Common Prayer, to inform, and to be interpreted in the context of, the Prayer Book rites. The twelve sermons fall into two groups